

THE VITTA SANCHAY CO-OPERATIVE HOUSING SOCIETY LTD.

(Regd. No. BOM / HSG / 4604)

Minutes of the Special General Body Meeting of the Society held on Sunday, 6th November, 2022 at 10.00 a.m. in the Community Hall of the Society, exclusively on the subject to take preliminary decision in the matter of redevelopment of the buildings of the Society and selection of the Architect / Project Management Consultant

Shri Satish M. Deshpande chaired the meeting.

1. To facilitate the discussions, the members will be apprised about the concept of the Redevelopment, the directives of the Government of Maharashtra on redevelopment, etc.

As per BMC's DCPR 2034, entitlement of our Society is about 2.7 to 3.00 (depending upon the width of the Road). We have consumed marginally less than 1 FSI. To get the benefit of additional FSI we need to consume it by re-development of the Society Buildings.

Government of Maharashtra vide its circular dated 04.07.2019 has reviewed and revised guidelines for redevelopment of the building of the Society. Chairman explained some of the important guidelines and are as under:

- a. At Least 1/5 members should demand for redevelopment
- b. On receipt of the representation / demand, the Managing Committee within 8 days takes cognizance of the proposal in MC Meeting.
- c. Within 2 months General Body Meeting to be invited on the issue of Redevelopment.
- d. Agenda of the Special General Body meeting should be as under :
 - (i) To take a preliminary decision by taking into consideration the demand of the members for redevelopment of society's building and suggestions received in respect of the same.
 - (ii) To appoint an expert and experienced Architect / Project Management Consultant from the panel of government / local authorities for preparing a detailed techno commercial feasibility report for redevelopment of the project and to finalize the terms and conditions of work to be done by them.
 - (iii) To submit an outline of the program for redevelopment of the building.

- e. Attendance of minimum 2/3 members in the Sp.GBM is essential.
- f. At Least 51% of the total members of the Society should favour the redevelopment work.
- g. Once the General Body selects an expert and experienced Architect / Project Management Consultant further course of action as per the directives are required to be followed.

Chairman informed the house that attendance of the Sp. GBM is 82 including the members joined through a virtual meeting platform, which is more than 2/3 of the total members of the Society, therefore, we can proceed with the meeting.

Chairman explained that members may kindly note clause No. 2 , 4 and 5 of the agenda of our Sp. GBM dated 06.11.2022 are identical as per the Directives. However, for further clarity and transparency in the selection process, the Management Committee has decided to add 2 points in the agenda as mentioned at Clause (1) To brief members about the redevelopment process and at Clause (3) Presentation by Architects / Project Management Consultants, one by one.

Chairman also explained that the directives issued by the Government of Maharashtra dated 04.07.2019 are under Section 79 A of the MCS Act, 1960. In the case of Abhang Samata CHS v/s Parag Bianni and Arkade Developers, High Court Bombay has pronounced that the Directives under Section 79 of the MCS Act are not mandatory, its sufficient compliance is sufficient. However for sake of clarity and transparency we will follow all the directives as far as possible.

2. To take preliminary decision by taking into consideration demand of the members for redevelopment of society's building and suggestions received in respect of the same.

- (A)** All are aware that the Managing Committee received representation from 35 members for re-development of the Society buildings in 2021. The matter was taken up in the AGM dated 31.01.2021 for deliberation and decision thereon.

“AGM resolved that the representation submitted by the 35 members shall be given due consideration and the Special General Body Meeting of the Society shall be convened as per guidelines dated 04.07.2019 issued by Government of Maharashtra. Agenda of the said Sp. GBM also shall be as per the said guidelines.”

The resolution was passed with absolute majority i.e. 48 were in favour and 7 against the proposal. 55 members attended the meeting.

(B) Status report of the process of re-development after resolution passed in the AGM for FY 2019-20 held on 31.01.2021.

a. In the AGM dated 30.09.2021, due to CORONA pandemic delay in progress of the inviting quotations, matters on finalization / selection of the Project Management consultant were very well explained. During this period legal notice from 4 members was also received, their say and replies to the said queries was briefed in the AGM dated 30.09.2021.

b. It was also explained in the said AGM dated 30.09.2021 that Managing Committee received 9 quotations from the reputed parties, out of which 5 parties were shortlisted namely;

- M/s. VSA Space Design
- M/s. Arch Unique
- M/s. Deole Bros.
- M/s. One stop Project Management Consultants
- M/s. Godbole and Associates.

c. Restrictions issued by the Government of Maharashtra dated 30.07.2021, to conduct General Body Meetings for societies having more than 50 members, during the Corona Pandemic were also explained. And the resolution passed in the said AGM dated 30.09.2021 is reproduced here-in-below:

“It was resolved that due to corona pandemic and restrictions imposed by Government of Maharashtra, delay if any, in convening the special General Body Meeting on the matter of re-development is condoned. It was also resolved that the Managing Committee is authorized to convene the Sp. General Body Meeting on the issue of re-development, after the restrictions of physical attendance of above 50 members, due to corona pandemic or otherwise, is lifted”.

The resolution was passed unanimously. 64 members attended the meeting.

(C) Election process of the Society was completed in May 2022.

- (D) Before AGM dated 25.09.2022, 32 members reminded the Managing Committee about the earlier resolutions on redevelopment and requested the Managing Committee to take up the issue of selection of the Project Management Consultant, expeditiously.

In the said AGM dated 25.09.2022 it was resolved as under:

“In accordance with the earlier resolutions for selection of the Project Management Consultant and as per the recent representation by 32 members, it was resolved to convene a Sp. General Body Meeting for selection of the Project Management Consultant on 6th November 2022.”

The resolution was passed unanimously. 49 members attended the meeting.

- (E) Status report of the process adopted by the Managing Committee before the Sp. GBM dated 06.11.2022 is as under :
- a) As per guidelines of GOM dated 04.07.2019 Managing Committee was required to invite quotations only from 3 Architects / PMCs. We received 9 quotations and shortlisted 5 parties as explained earlier.
 - b) On the instructions of Shri. Amal Kulkarni and Shri. Vinod Aher, Managing Committee in its meeting dated 14.10.2022 (both of them were present as invitee in the said meeting) decided to seek further details from all the 5 parties to assess their credentials and asked all the parties for details about Company, profile, Organizational Structure of the Party, Project Executed in the last 5 years etc.
 - c) Both of them (Shri. Amal Kulkarni and Shri. Vinod Aher) scrutinized documents considering various parameters like (1) firm established year (2) Owner qualification (3) Price quoted (4) Services offered (5) Scope related to services detailed out in the quotation (6) Recommendation letters attached with the quotations (7) Ongoing Redevelopment projects (8) Completed Redevelopment Projects (9) Rating for details provided in the quotation (10) other advantages / observations , if any.
 - d) Based on the documents submitted, Shri. Amal Kulkarni and Shri. Vinod Aher was of the opinion that as regards M/s. VSA, it

is difficult to analyze their credentials in the field of redevelopment, therefore, it was decided to invite the following 4 parties for presentation before Sp. GBM.

- M/s. Arch Unique
 - M/s. Deole Bros.
 - M/s. One stop Project Management Consultants
 - M/s. Godbole and Associates.
- e) All the 4 parties were asked to submit their confirmation to give a presentation in the Sp. GBM and they have confirmed, in writing.
- f) Therefore, all the 4 parties were invited to give their presentation before Sp. GBM. and after the preliminary decision on redevelopment they will give their presentation , one by one.

Members may kindly note that the Managing Committee took cognizance of the application of 35 members (1/3 of the members) for redevelopment and put up the matter in the AGM dated 31.01.2021. It is also to be noted that in accordance with the resolution passed in the Annual General Body Meetings dated 31.01.2021 and 30.09.2021 and as reminded Managing Committee by 32 members about the resolutions already passed and as resolved in the AGM dated 25.09.2022 and as explained to the house and as recorded in the minutes here-in-above, Sp. GBM was convened on 06.11.2022. As such the preliminary decisions have already been taken for redevelopment. Short listing of Architects / PMC was also done. However, to fulfill the criteria in the said directives, it was resolved as under:

“It was resolved that by taking into consideration the demand of the members for redevelopment of society’s building it was preliminary decided to initiate the process for redevelopment of the buildings of the Society.”

Proposed by Shri. Harshal Choudhary , Secretary, Seconded by Shri. Pravaschandra Khadpe and Shri. Narayan M. Patil and passed by absolute majority. Passed by 81 votes in favor of the resolution out of 82 attendees. The members who participated virtually gave their consent on the virtual meeting platform.

3. Presentation by Architects / Project Management Consultants, one by one.

- a. M/s. One stop Project Management Consultants pvt. Ltd.
- b. M/s. Arch Unique

- c. M/s. Godbole Mukadam & Associates
- d. M/s. Sunil Deole & Bros.

All the 4 parties were given 20 minutes for their presentation and 10 minutes for question answer session. Evaluation Committee members raised technical queries based on the presentation of parties. Members also raised queries. All queries were suitably answered by parties.

4. To appoint an expert and experienced Architect / Project Management Consultant from the panel of government / local authorities for preparing a detailed techno commercial feasibility report for redevelopment of the project and to finalize the terms and conditions of work to be done by them.

- Chairman drew the attention of the members that the procedure for selection of Architect / PMC was annexed to the notice dated 21.10.2022 inviting Sp. GBM. In the said annexure, constitution of Evaluation Committee, evaluation criteria and basis of evaluation was also given.
- **Evaluation Committee:** The Managing Committee decided to constitute an Evaluation Committee which will evaluate technical terms and to recommend two experts. However, selection of the expert will be on the basis of voting by members. Members may vote for any of the 4 Architect / PMC.
- **Members of the Committee:** Shri. Amal Kulkarni, Shri. Vinod Aher, Shri. Girish Patil represented being expert in the field and Shri. Ulhas Rane and Dr. Sadashiv Choudhary represented common members on behalf of the rest of the members of the Society.
- **Recommendation by Evaluation Committee:** Based on the proposals submitted earlier and presentation made on the day of the meeting by all 4 Architect / PMC, the Committee carried out an evaluation and presented their recommendation. The evaluation was not only based on lowest rate, it was based on a 5-point gradation system, namely considering Company Profile / Staff Qualification, Work experience in the field, Area/locality in which major projects were delivered, Clarity in proposal, presentation, and Idea / opinion about our potential. Shri. Amal Kulkarni and Shri. Vinod Aher on behalf of the evaluation committee briefed the house about evaluation criteria and ratings given by them based on the above parameters. The evaluation committee then recommended 2 names for selection. 1.M/s. Deole Bros. 2. M/s. One Stop Project Management Consultant.

- **Selection by Voting** was done by raising hands. 71 physically present members and 4 members joined through Virtual meeting platform, a total of 75 members voted for M/S. Deole Bros, 4 physically present members voted for M/s. One Stop Project management Consultants and 1 physically present member voted for M/s. Godbole & Mukadam Associates.

On completing all the formalities as mentioned above following resolution was passed:

“ It was resolved that M/s. Deole Bros. shall be appointed as an expert and experienced Architect / Project Management Consultant for preparing a detailed techno commercial feasibility report for redevelopment of the project of buildings of the Vitta Sanchay co-operative Housing Society.”

Proposed by Secretary, Seconded by Shri. Ashok More and Shri. Nandkumar Sawant and carried by majority.

Written consent of the members, who exercised their vote in favor of redevelopment to enable the Managing Committee to proceed further for redevelopment process and selection of the Architect / Project Management Consultant was obtained.

Chairman explained that the quotations were asked from the parties for the Scope of work as detailed below:

- **Scope of work as per the Govt. Directives dated 04.07.2019** - Work to be done in the initial stage by Architect / Project management consultant:-
 - a) To carry out survey of the land and building of the Society.
 - b) To obtain information about conveyance of the Society land.
 - c) To obtain information regarding FSI and TDR that would be available as per the buildings and land of the Society in view of the prevailing policy of the Government as well as the Regulations of MHADA/SRA/Municipal Corporation that would be applicable from time to time on the basis of title of the land. Accordingly, the concerned societies would be required to take action in that regard.
 - d) To prepare the realistic report by taking into consideration such factors as the residential area, commercial area, open area, garden, parking, construction specifications etc., to be furnished to the

- e) Architect / Project Management Consultant should prepare the project report within two months of the date of his appointment and to submit the same to the committee of the society.
- f) Submit feasibility report of the project, considering present market scenario.

“Therefore terms and conditions of work to be done by M/s. Deole Bros. shall be as under:

- (i) Scope of work will be as per the enquiry dated 08.07.2021. However, the Managing Committee is authorized to alter the terms and conditions in consultation of Shri. Amal Kulkarni and Shri. Vinod Aher.
- (ii) M/s. Deole Bros. should seek suggestions and recommendations from the members of Society regarding redevelopment.
- (iii) M/s. Deole Bros. should prepare the project report within two months of the date of his appointment and submit the same to the managing committee of the society.”

Proposed by Secretary, Seconded by Shri. Ramchandra Shinde and carried unanimously.

5. To submit outline of the program for redevelopment of the building.

Chairman explained that the decision making process for redevelopment / self redevelopment will be in 5 stages and at each stage members will be taken into confidence.

Stage 1.

Stage 1, is comprised of the process of taking preliminary decision to initiate process of re-development, selection of the expert to prepare project report. The said process has already been taken care off, in the meeting.

- The Management Committee shall prepare minutes of the Sp. GBM and will circulate the copy of the Minutes within 7 days. Copy of the said minutes will be presented to the Dy. Registrar, CS, M-Ward.
- Creation of Website of the Society.
- Issue appointment letter to the Architect / Project management Consultant.
- On receipt of the redevelopment project report joint meeting of the Managing Committee and Architect / PMC to be held, interested members can be present as an observer.

- Forward suggestions received from the members for the consideration of the Architect/ PMC.
- Managing Committee meeting - comprehensive discussion on factors such as the suggestions / recommendations of the members and the opinion of the Architect / PMC. The project Report with necessary modifications should be approved by majority vote.

Stage 2 :

- Sp. GBM will be convened to decide whether we should go ahead with further process of Re-Development.
- Based on the project / feasibility report Sp. GBM will decide whether we should go for redevelopment by developer or by self – redevelopment.
 - o If redevelopment by the developer is decided, then an Architect / PMC will be appointed, for tendering process and overall control.
 - o If self redevelopment is decided various agencies like an Architect / PMC, Designing Architect, agency to liaison with BMC, Structural Engineer etc. will be appointed as may be required for further process of redevelopment.

Stage 3 : Joint meetings

- Considerations of Suggestions of members.
- Decide specifications of the construction, amenities etc.
- Tender draft finalization.
- Architect / PMC to invite tenders from developers in case of decision to execute the work through developer / in case decided to go for self redevelopment invite tenders from contractor.
- Preparing List of bids received.
- Publish the list of the bids received on Notice board and Web site.
- Opening of tenders by the Managing Committee in the presence of Rep. of Bidders & interested members as observers, if any.
- Preparation of comparative chart by Architect / PMC.
- Architect / PMC will scrutinize bids, after checking merit, reputation, experience and competitive rates etc., shortlist 3 bidders. In case less than 3 bids are received, then, all the bids will be put up before Sp. GBM.

Stage 4 : Selection of Developer / Contractor

- Convening Special General Body Meeting for finalizing tender – Selecting a Developer or Contractor as the case may be.

a. Conditions to be fulfilled for Sp. GBM:

1. Authorized representative of the registrar to be present for the meeting.
2. Quorum – 2/3 rd of the members of the Society.
3. Arrangement for video shooting of the process of meeting.

b. Agenda of the Special General Body

1. Providing Comparative Statement.
2. Presentation by bidders one by one.
3. Selection of one of the Developer / Contractor and finalizing terms and conditions.
4. Information about further course of actions.

c. After Selection of the Developer / Contractor

1. Consent of the selected Developer / Contractor.
2. Written approval by 51 % vote of the total members.

Stage 5 : Development Agreement / Contract terms

- Development Agreement in case of redevelopment by Developer / Contractor terms finalization in case of self – redevelopment

In case members desire more meetings at any stage for decision making, the Management Committee will take a call and decide, in consultation with the Architect / PMC.

Once the decision making process is over, execution of the development work with the assistance of the Architect / PMC will be taken care off.

Chairman appreciated the members for their attendance on a large scale and participation for preliminary decision to initiate process for redevelopment process and selection of Architect / PMC with thumping majority. The Managing Committee will honor the decision of the members and will act accordingly.

Members may note that in the process of Redevelopment, transparency will be given topmost priority. We don't want to proceed with the redevelopment hurriedly. We want to take all the members on board, however, there may be a possibility that some members may be reluctant for the process of redevelopment, for any reason. Committee will try to convince them. In case all

efforts to convince all the members fail, the Committee will be compelled to go with a majority decision.

The project is a big one and involves various processes / activities, there are a lot of possibilities that any person may misguide members with vested interest. We request all members that in case of any confusion, misinformation, they can contact any of the Managing Committee Members for resolution of their doubts.

Meeting concluded with thanks to the chair.

On behalf of the Managing Committee.



(Harshal A. Choudhary)
Secretary

Place : Mumbai

Date : 12.11.2022.